

**REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON RESULTS OF  
ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS FOR  
ACCREDITATION MASTER 'S DEGREES PROGRAMME IN MEDICAL  
AND HEALTH PROFESSIONS EDUCATION**

**6M110100 - "MEDICINE"  
OF THE NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATION  
"KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"**

**1. Composition of the External Expert Commission**

In accordance with the Order of the ECAQA No. 29 dated April 5, 2019, the External Expert Commission was formed to conduct specialized (programmatic) accreditation of the Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University, on April 23-24, 2019, as follows:



**Chairperson of the External Expert Commission**

SHAMSUTDINOVA ALPHIA GUMAROVNA, PhD, Head of the Center for Innovation and Education JSC Central Clinical Hospital (Almaty) President of the Association for Bioethics and Medical Law, Member of the World Association of Medical Law, European Association of Pediatrics and Adolescent Gynecology Tel. + 7778 957 60 57, e-mail: [shamsutdinova@ckb.kz](mailto:shamsutdinova@ckb.kz)



**Foreign Expert**

RUDOY ANDREY SEMENOVICH, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Military Field Therapy - Professor of the Military Medical Faculty of the EE "Belarusian State Medical University", Corresponding Member. Academy of Military Sciences of the Russian Federation, member of the Russian Scientific Society of Physicians, the Eurasian Association of Therapists, the European Society of Cardiology, the European Society of Gastroenterologists and the European Society  
e-mail: [andrew\\_rudoy@mail.ru](mailto:andrew_rudoy@mail.ru)



**National academic expert**

Ramazanova Manshuk Anerovna  
Senior lecturer Public  
Health and Health Care  
JSC "National Medical University"  
Tel. + 77078228590, e-mail: m\_ [ramazanova00@mail.ru](mailto:ramazanova00@mail.ru)



**Expert - representative of practical health care**

Tekebayeva Latina Ayzhanovna, MD, PhD, Director of the Clinical Center of Neurology and Rehabilitation "Alfred +"  
Head of the Department of Neurology and Neurosurgery,  
Medical University of Kazakhstan "VSHOZ"

Tel. + 77078335758, e-mail: [lati.teckebaeva@yandex.kz](mailto:lati.teckebaeva@yandex.kz)



**Expert - Master Student**

Ligay Denis Nikolaevich

A master's degree in the specialty "Medicine" JSC "Kazakh  
Medical University of Continuing Education"

Tel. + 7 (700) 109 9913, e-mail: [dionis\\_sergion@mail.ru](mailto:dionis_sergion@mail.ru)



**ECAQA observer**

**Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna**

MD, Dr of Med Sc, MBA, Professor of the Eurasian Centre  
for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education  
and Health Care, Director General

tel. + 77013291665, e-mail: [info@ecaqa.org](mailto:info@ecaqa.org)

In the period from 12.03.2018 till 22.04.2019 was carried out conformity assessment activities HPO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" Standards for Accreditation Master 'S Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education.

The EEC report contains an assessment of the university to the Standards, the EEC recommendations to further improve the implementation of the graduate university.

## **2. General part of the final report of the EEC**

### **Presentation of the university and the Master's degrees programme 6M110100 - "Medicine"**

HPO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter - KazRosmeduniversity) was established in 1992 as the Kazakh Medical Institute (KMI). In 2010, KMI has been renamed to the Kazakh-Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration № 9833-1910-U-th of May 4, 2010).

KazRosmeduniversity currently represents the organization of medical education with private ownership, has the necessary material and technical, scientific and educational base, highly qualified teaching and research staff (the license for educational activity AB number 0137388 issued by the Committee for Control of Education and Science of the MES RK June 2, 2010). The university trains specialists in the levels: undergraduate, internship, residency and a master's degree on the basis of the available state licenses for undergraduate and postgraduate levels, additional education according to the current SES RK.

By order of acting Chairman of the Committee for Control of Education and Science, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 15, 2018 №264 in KazRosmeduniversity opened direction of magistracy on specialties 6M110100 "Medicine" (License №0137388) and 6M110200 "Public Health" (License №0162831) .

Currently enrolled in a master's degree 16 master's degree, 11 of them in the specialty 6M110200 - "Public Health", 5 in the specialty 6M110100 - "Medicine", 10 on scientific and pedagogical direction, 6 - on the profile. Teaching is carried out by staff members 26 and 2 pluralists. Total percent of teachers who have academic degrees are 92.85%.

Over the years the University has formed its own brand, tradition and values, while continuing to follow the path to the international level universities designated by the government. The principles of the Bologna Process, credit system of education implemented in all undergraduate majors.

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science" KazRosmeduniversity was accredited by the Ministry of Education and

Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and technical activities, certificate number Series MK № 005269 from 08.10.2018, the

KazRosmeduniversity budget is formed from a number of sources: the national budget (the state order for training of specialists of higher, postgraduate and additional education) and the provision of paid educational services. University funding is stable and contributes to the improvement of material and technical base and the increase in population.

The main applied research area of KazRosMedUniversity is the development of innovations for implementation in practical healthcare, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, for achievements in the development of mobile medical complexes, Rector Jainakbayev N.T. was awarded with the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute for Quality Standard "International Quality Certificate" (SIQS) on July 1, 2015.

Since 2011, the university journal "Actual problems of theoretical and clinical medicine" is published on a quarterly basis.

In order to promote international cooperation signed 45 agreements and memorandums with foreign universities.

In 2012 and 2018 the University successfully passed the state certification of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Preparation of students conducted in the state, Russian and English languages. Over 27 years of activity, the University trained over 6000 professionals working successfully in practical public health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

His mission of the university is also implemented through the educational programs of higher and postgraduate education in the specialty 6M110100 - "Medicine" (period of study 1, 1.5, 2 years (Master), whose objectives are: training of competitive professionals able to meet the needs of society in health help to apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in the practice and science use advances in information and communication technologies, strengthening public health.

Mission and Vision, which have previously discussed and agreed with stakeholders (teachers, employees, employers) set out on the website <http://medkrmu.kz/missiya-universiteta/> and KazRosmeduniversity develops its activity through the Strategic Development Plan KazRosmeduniversity (long-term) (<http://medkrmu.kz/strategicheskie-plany-razvitiya/>) and operational plan to implement the strategy (academic year), which are discussed and approved at the meeting of the Academic Council of the University with the participation of stakeholders.

KazRosmeduniversity has its organizational structure, approved by Order rector (No.277 dated 01.11.2018).

University management is implemented through collective bodies: the Scientific Council (CS), the Academic Council (AC), Scientific Clinical Board (SAB), the local

Ethics Committee (LEC), the Coordination Council for Quality and Strategic Development (KSKiSR), Council of Young Scientists and Student scientific society (SMU and CHO).

### **3. The analysis of compliance of Master degrees programme 6M110100 - "Medicine" Standards for Accreditation Master's Degrees Programme in Medical And Health Professions Education and an overview of the strengths of each standard**

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

The external expert commission received confirmation that the mission of KazRosmeduniversity and the mission of the Master's program in the specialty "Medicine" is consistent with the goals and objectives of postgraduate medical education, the needs of the country's health care system and the development of human resources in medical education. During interviews with undergraduates and teachers, interviews with heads of departments and representatives of practical public health, the participation of staff, employees, undergraduates and employers in the discussion of mission and goals was established. Education in the master's degree in "Medicine"

#### **Strengths:**

- the orientation of the educational program majoring 6M110100 "Medicine" waiting for the employer and the labor market needs.
- orientation of the educational process on formation of professional liability, clinical skills, for the protection of the patient's health knowledge and skills, striving for continuous self-improvement, continuous professional development and training throughout life.
- the introduction in the educational process of innovative teaching methods.
- integration of academic, medical diagnostic and scientific trends in the educational program of a specialty 6M110100 "Medicine".
- demand for graduates HPO "KazRosmeduniversity" on Kazakhstan market of medical services.

**WEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 20 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1:** Completed  
**recommendations:** no

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROCESS**

The educational program on a specialty 6M110100 "Medicine" is being implemented in accordance with the mission, objectives and expected learning outcomes and reflects the SES, the needs and expectations of society. The methods

used, forms of teaching and learning, as well as the content of the OP based on modern principles, contribute to the formation of professional competencies and define the content, scope and sequence of components of training.

The EEC has received convincing evidence of methodological support of educational programs, teachers use a variety of teaching methods. When survey of undergraduates set a high percentage of satisfaction with training in KazRosmeduniversity.

**Strong sides:**

- the qualitative content of the educational program that meets the practical needs of health care;
- competence-oriented approach;
- a variety of training courses (individual educational trajectories);
- educational infrastructure is a three-stage training; conditions for the implementation of intellectual and creative abilities of undergraduates;
- cooperation with scientific, educational and medical institutions both abroad and inside RK;
- compliance with state educational standards; continuous qualitative upgrade of material and technical base

**The EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 16 correspond partially - 2 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 2:** Completed.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) To introduce remote training component in the implementation of master's programs in order to optimize the educational process and to attract more students;
- 2) In the development of electives to take into account current practical needs of health care;
- 3) To attract foreign partners as mentors, external reviewers of educational programs, teaching materials, scientific publications and master's theses.

**Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING**

Principles, methods and practices of assessment of professional competences of undergraduates enrolled in an educational program in the specialty 6M110100 "Medicine", guarantee the openness and accessibility, ensuring the achievement of undergraduates learning outcomes and are comparable to the teaching methodology. Ensure a balance between formative and summative assessment. Assessment of academic skills corresponds to the magistracy. During the interview undergraduates experts found that more than 90% of students recognize the validity and objectivity of the assessment methods of their knowledge and skills.

**Strengths:**

- formation and evaluation of all the key competencies of graduates;
- transparent procedure for assessment of educational achievements in all phases of training;
- orientation of educational programs on learning outcomes;
- monitoring of the development of undergraduates learning outcomes through feedback to improve the quality

**The EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 9 correspond partially - 1 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 3:** Completed

**recommendations:** To activate feedback from graduates and teachers for improving educational graduate programs.

#### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

KazRosmeduniversity conducts academic tolerance policy: openness, transparency and accessibility, both at the reception and throughout the life of master degree. Information about the academic policy is updated, updated, published on the website and is publicly available.

KazRosmeduniversity allocates and distributes resources to support graduate students. University intra high allocated 10 grants to study a Masters in two specialties "Medicine" and "Public Health", including 4 of 5 specialty "Medicine". The EEC experts provided evidence of effective policies for attracting, recruiting and selection of students.

##### **Strengths:**

- high qualification of the teaching staff of the department;
- participation of students in all medical activities;
- availability of information and service (library, academic counseling, career center) undergraduates

The EEC conclusions according to criteria correspond to - 12 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 4:** Completed

**recommendations:** no

#### **Standard 5: STAFFING**

KazRosmeduniversity fully qualified teachers provided with a high degree ostepenennyh. There is sufficient availability of qualified teachers with ample research experience for undergraduates thesis preparation. Personnel potential of the University owns modern teaching technologies and methods, creates the conditions necessary for the full development and socialization of students, translates the best practices that can effectively implement vocational training programs in accordance with the requirements



of qualification characteristics of teaching staff and requirements for licensing of educational activities.

**Strengths:**

- the presence of the highest qualification of medical category, large medical and pedagogical experience of work of the teaching staff;
- availability of human resources policies to encourage and reward teachers to develop their expertise in education;
- employee development, support their learning, ensuring their continued professional development (school teacher).

**The EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 10 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5:** Completed

**Recommendations for improvement:** no

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP**

KazRosmeduniversity has developed material and technical base, equipped with a fund of educational, methodical, scientific literature in print and electronic media, the training and technical aids and information and communication technologies. The University conducts systematic work on the development, renewal and replenishment of material and technical equipment and the introduction of new information and communication technologies in the educational process. Periodically conducts teacher training with the assistance of domestic and foreign experts

**Strengths:**

- sufficient material and technical base for training undergraduates majoring 6M110100 "Medicine";
- the opportunity for self-training of students by providing access to educational library and Internet resources

**WEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 4 correspond partially -0 not correspond - 0.

**Standard 6:** Completed

**recommendations:**

- 1) Greater use of information and computer technology in the implementation of educational programs and practical skills of undergraduates;
- 2) To strengthen the website content of the list of Magistracy.

**Standard 7: MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS**

KazRosmeduniversitet has an effective educational programs assessment and monitoring system that focuses on the satisfaction of students with the level of



education. University systematically collects, analyzes, corrects and supplements the feedback of teachers and students in relation to the stated mission, goals, objectives and strategic plan.

**Strengths:**

- monitoring and evaluation of the educational program, based on a tiered approach D. Kirkpatrick .;
- optionally forming process OP component;
- Feedback from stakeholders; that the necessary conditions for the implementation of intellectual and creative abilities of graduate education program;
- implementation of education at the state and Russian languages; availability of creative and professional links with scientific, educational and medical organizations both abroad and in the Republic of Kazakhstan; compliance with state educational standards;
- continuous qualitative upgrade of material and technical base.

**The EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 8 correspond partially -0 not correspond - 0.

**Standard 7:** Completed

**recommendations:**

1) To activate feedback from graduates and teachers for improving educational graduate programs.

**Standard 8. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

KazRosmeduniversity management has a sufficient level of management competence, assumes the responsibility for the implementation of all processes, ensuring the achievement of the mission. The control system and its activities are open, transparent and accessible. The university is ready and able to change. It ensures the effectiveness of management activities.

**Strengths:**

- Continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work, aimed at achieving the mission of the educational program;
- transparency of the management system and the decisions taken;
- defined academic leadership responsibility for the development and management of the educational program;
- stable financial condition KazRosmeduniversity;
- extensive cooperation with partners in the health sector

**The EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 19 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 8:** Completed.

**Recommendations for improvement:** no

## **Standard 9. PROGRAMME RENEWAL**

KazRosmeduniversity continuously reviewing the organizational and staff structure, actualize the objectives and strategic development plan functions, regulatory documentation, taking into account health needs and society, modernizing the material and technical basis, will improve modern educational technologies and innovations in the learning process for the implementation of institutional goals and college tasks, the needs of students and practical public health.

### **Strengths:**

- professional development of teaching staff every 5 years, including on pedagogical competences; PPP participated in the training events (seminars, workshops, conferences);
- introduction of innovative technologies in the educational process;
- exchange of experience with colleagues in other institutions of education and science, process management graduate program involving monitoring, evaluation and review.

**The EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 4 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 9:** Completed

**Recommendations:** to strengthen implementation of the program 3-lingual education at the graduate level.

## **4. Recommendations to improve the Master degrees programme 6M110100 - "Medicine" HPO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University":**

- 1) To introduce remote training component in the implementation of master's programs in order to optimize the educational process and to attract more students;
- 2) In the development of electives to take into account current practical needs of health care;
- 3) Greater use of information and computer technology in the implementation of educational programs and practical skills of undergraduates;
- 4) To activate feedback from graduates and teachers for improving educational graduate programs;
- 5) To strengthen the website content of the list of Magistracy;
- 6) To attract foreign partners as mentors, external reviewers of educational programs, teaching materials, scientific publications and master's theses;
- 7) To intensify the implementation of the program 3-lingual education at the graduate level.

5. The EEC members came to unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit **Master's Programme 6M110100 - "Medicine" of The Non-Profit Organization "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"** for 5 years

Chairperson of the EEC                      Shamsutdinova Alpha Gumarovna

Foreign Expert                                      Rudoy Andrey Semenovich

National academic expert                      Ramazanova Manshuk Anerovna

Expert - representative  
of practical health care                      Tekebayeva Latina Ayzhanovna

Expert – Master student                      Ligay Denis Nikolaevich

ECAQA observer                                      Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna

## 7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать образовательную программу магистратуры по специальности 6М110100 — Медицина на период 5 лет.

**Председатель  
Внешней экспертной  
комиссии**

Шамсутдинова Альфия  
Гумаровна

**Зарубежный эксперт  
Национальный  
академический  
эксперт**

Рудой Андрей Семенович  
Рамазанова Маншук  
Анеровна

**Эксперт -  
представитель  
практического  
здравоохранения**

Текебаева Латина  
Айжановна

**Эксперт - слушатель**

Лигай Денис Николаевич

**Наблюдатель ЕЦА**

Сарсенбаева Сауле  
Сергазиевна



**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of Master's degrees program  
6M110100 - "Medicine"  
of the Kazakh-Russian Medical University**

standard	Criteria for assessment	Assessment		
		Comply	Partially comply	Do not comply
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	20	0	0
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROCESS	16	2	0
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT LEARNING	9	1	0
4.	STUDENTS	12	0	0
5.	STAFFING	10	0	0
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES, SETTINGS AND SCHOLARSHIP	4	0	0
7.	MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROCESS	8	0	0
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	19	0	0
9.	PROGRAMME RENEWAL	4	0	0
	<b>Total</b>	<b>102</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0</b>